

**NATIVE AMERICAN GRAVES PROTECTION AND REPATRIATION
REVIEW COMMITTEE**

JUNE 8, 2009
TELECONFERENCE

ADMINISTRATIVE MEETING OF THE
SUBCOMMITTEE CREATED PURSUANT TO
25 U.S.C. 3006 (b) (1) (C)

**NATIVE AMERICAN GRAVES PROTECTION AND REPATRIATION
REVIEW COMMITTEE**

3:05 p.m. EST

Monday, June 8, 2009

Teleconference

Administrative Meeting of the
Subcommittee Created Pursuant to
25 U.S.C. (b) (1) (C)

PRESENT AT THE MEETING:

SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS:

Mr. Dan Monroe, Chair

Ms. Sonya Atalay

Ms. Donna Augustine

Mr. Alan Goodman

Mr. Eric Hemenway

AT-LARGE MEMBER AND REVIEW COMMITTEE CHAIR:

Mr. Colin Kippen

TABLE OF CONTENTS

OPENING REMARKS	4
DISCUSSION OF THE PROCESS FOR DEVELOPING A CONSENTED-TO LIST OF PERSONS FOR THE AT-LARGE MEMBER POSITION	9
NOMINATIONS TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THE LIST OF PERSONS	13
DISCUSSION	13
MOTION	18
MOTION	21
CLOSING COMMENTS	27
MEETING ADJOURNED	29

1 **OPENING REMARKS**

2 DAVID TARLER: Good afternoon, everyone, or
3 good morning as the case might be. This is David
4 Tarler and Sherry Hutt.

5 ALAN GOODMAN: Good morning.

6 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Hello.

7 ERIC HEMENWAY: Good morning or good afternoon.

8 SONYA ATALAY: Hello.

9 STEPHEN SIMPSON: Hello.

10 COLIN KIPPEN: Good morning. This is Colin
11 Kippen.

12 ALAN GOODMAN: Good afternoon. This is Alan
13 Goodman.

14 ERIC HEMENWAY: Good afternoon. This is Eric
15 Hemenway.

16 SONYA ATALAY: Hello, this is Sonya Atalay.

17 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Good afternoon. This is Donna
18 Augustine.

19 CARLA MATTIX: Hi, this is Carla Mattix.

20 STEPHEN SIMPSON: And this is Stephen Simpson.

21 LESA KOSCIELSKI: Hi, this is Lesa Koscielski.

22 COLIN KIPPEN: Good. Is Dan - is Dan Monroe on
23 the call?

24 DAVID TARLER: Dan is - Dan is not on the call.
25 This is David Tarler, and he does have the call-in

1 number so we should - we should have him shortly.

2 COLIN KIPPEN: All right. This is Colin, and
3 just for purposes of this meeting what I wanted to
4 do is just lay out very quickly what our procedure
5 is. There has been some activity that has occurred
6 since our last meeting in Seattle. And in that
7 meeting in Seattle a vote was attempted to nominate
8 the seventh member of the committee, and under the
9 law, as I'm sure you folks know, the seventh member
10 is the consensus member and the law requires - this
11 is the NAGPRA Statute, requires that this
12 appointment is made by the Secretary from a list of
13 people developed and consented to, and it says, by
14 all of the members appointed pursuant to the NAGPRA
15 law in sections (A) and (B).

16 What that basically means is that the religious
17 leaders and the Native leaders who are on this
18 committee, as well as the scientific members, must
19 all agree to the names that will be put forward to
20 the Secretary. And the situation that arose at our
21 last meeting in Seattle is that we were missing one
22 of our essential members, Donna Augustine, from
23 participation in that - she was not present at the
24 meeting so we could not meet this requirement of
25 having all of the members who are eligible to make

1 this recommendation making this recommendation. And
2 so we were - we were not able to move forward.

3 A question arose during the meeting as to
4 whether this vote should go forward in the absence
5 of Donna on the call, and the decision that was made
6 was that we would not go forward without Donna's
7 presence. And so this conference call has been set
8 up for today so that we can comply with the statute
9 for making the recommendation of this consensus
10 member by all of the members.

11 The situation we're now in is that Dan - Dan
12 Monroe is not present on the call, and he is
13 necessary as well because he is one of the
14 scientific members. So we are in a position - we
15 are in a similar position that we were in earlier in
16 that one of the members that is necessary to make
17 this recommendation is not present with us.

18 And so I want to make clear too for purposes of
19 the record that we had - I requested a legal opinion
20 during the meeting from Stephen Simpson about the
21 necessity of us having all members before we go
22 forward and then I also requested a formal legal
23 opinion after the meeting, five days after the
24 meeting, which I have received from Stephen Simpson
25 and our counsel - excuse me - that we did receive an

1 opinion from Carla Mattix and Stephen Simpson
2 regarding some of these matters.

3 So Mr. Tarler, how should - what is your
4 suggestion as to how we should proceed at this time?

5 DAVID TARLER: Mr. Chairman, Sherry Hutt at this
6 moment is trying to contact Dan Monroe. I spoke
7 personally with his secretary and with Dan today and
8 they do have the call-in number -

9 COLIN KIPPEN: Maybe this is him.

10 DAN MONROE: Hello.

11 COLIN KIPPEN: Dan? Hello, Dan?

12 DAN MONROE: Yes, I'm here. Sorry.

13 COLIN KIPPEN: Oh, Dan, great. All right.
14 Okay.

15 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Mr. Chairman?

16 COLIN KIPPEN: Yes.

17 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Can I just say something
18 really quick? This is Donna Augustine.

19 COLIN KIPPEN: Aloha, Donna.

20 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Hi, everybody. I just want to
21 say that I apologize for not being at the last
22 meeting. There was - my son was sick and I was
23 having some health issues as well. And I just want
24 to clarify that I didn't receive that call. I was
25 with my son that night, so I spent that Saturday and

1 that night, and by the time I received Sherry Hutt's
2 phone call for me to call while you guys were in
3 meeting to make a decision or whatever, it was too
4 late. And I contacted her immediately and I - by
5 the time I got a hold of her she was already at the
6 airport and I think it was Sunday afternoon or
7 whatever. So I had no idea that she was trying to
8 get a hold of me and I apologize to everyone. It
9 really, truly was not intentional. But I'm really
10 here now.

11 ALAN GOODMAN: Yes, and this is Alan. Can I
12 also just interject I have 20 minutes, and then I'm
13 going to have to go.

14 COLIN KIPPEN: Well, here's the process. It is
15 neither fair nor appropriate that I participate in
16 the vote on this because I am not one of the
17 scientific or Native leaders on the committee. I am
18 now occupying the consensus position and my term
19 will lapse in a couple of months. So it is not
20 appropriate that I be involved in the discussions of
21 this. I understand there is a list of names that
22 are coming forward. It appears that we have all of
23 the members who are eligible to vote on this matter
24 now present on this call.

25 And you know, as a final matter, I want to

1 indicate that after my own legal research I was of
2 the opinion that this is a matter that should have
3 been noticed and held publically but I am deferring
4 to the attorneys' legal opinion that I received and
5 believe that we will now go forward with this vote.

6 What I'm going to do now is I'm going to turn
7 the meeting over to Dan Monroe, who is the Vice
8 Chairman, who is one of the individuals eligible to
9 vote in this case. And I am going to now recuse
10 myself from any vote or participation in this,
11 except maybe to just wrap it up at the end.

12 But Dan, are you able now to conduct this -
13 conduct these proceedings?

14 DAN MONROE: I am, Colin, and thank you very
15 much.

16 COLIN KIPPEN: All right. Thank you.

17 ALAN GOODMAN: Thank you, Colin.

18 **DISCUSSION OF THE PROCESS FOR DEVELOPING A**
19 **CONSENTED-TO LIST OF PERSONS FOR THE AT-LARGE MEMBER**
20 **POSITION**

21 DAN MONROE: I know that several of us are
22 probably pressed for time, including myself. So I'm
23 going to just jump into it, and I think that we have
24 on the table a couple of decisions to make or a
25 decision to make at the very outset. And that

1 surrounds the following:

2 We can proceed legally with this teleconference
3 meeting, make a decision regarding the list that we
4 - of potential nominees or of nominees that we can
5 submit to the Secretary and the Secretary will in
6 turn act to make a choice based on that list. Or we
7 can delay this meeting if we felt it was essential
8 to do so, file a Federal Register notice, and
9 reconvene in a public meeting, albeit a
10 teleconference sometime conceivably in August.

11 What I'd like to do is put the question before
12 the committee very quickly as to whether or not
13 you're ready to proceed now or whether or not you
14 would like to consider delaying this meeting, filing
15 a meeting notice in the Federal Register, and to act
16 on this matter at a later date. Let me just add a
17 couple of other quick points, important ones. One,
18 that this is a meeting under any circumstance in
19 which there would not be any outside commentary
20 solicited by members of the public if this were a
21 public meeting at present. Two, that the results of
22 this meeting will and can be made readily accessible
23 to anyone who wishes to see them. So from a
24 transparency level, at least from my perspective, it
25 seems that either of these options produce

1 transparency. Having a public meeting doesn't
2 necessarily involve and wouldn't, in fact, permit
3 public comment or input.

4 So let's resolve that question and then
5 depending on the nature of the decision we make
6 we'll move forward with the rest of this meeting if
7 there is to be one. Are there any questions
8 regarding the options? Is everybody clear?

9 SONYA ATALAY: Yes.

10 ERIC HEMENWAY: Yes.

11 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Yes.

12 DAN MONROE: Let me just push this then forward.
13 How would you like to proceed and let's - we can
14 either have a brief discussion or we can just go
15 through a sort of voice vote. Does anybody want to
16 make any comments?

17 ALAN GOODMAN: Dan, this is Alan, can you - you
18 or anybody else on the line can do a little bit of
19 history, I mean has - I assume in all previous cases
20 these decisions have been made during the two - the
21 open meetings. Is that true or does anybody have
22 any sense of is there a precedent to doing this over
23 a telephone conference?

24 DAN MONROE: I'm not sure, and maybe somebody
25 from the NAGPRA Office knows, we've certainly had

1 administrative teleconferences in my experience in
2 the past. This is an administrative matter. It's
3 not a matter in which we would openly solicit input
4 or take comment from the public. It's really a
5 matter that -

6 ALAN GOODMAN: Yeah, and hearing that I think
7 I'm just as - you know, I think I'm willing to go
8 forward with that, you know, that we do have all
9 existing committee members who are eligible to
10 participate.

11 DAN MONROE: Right.

12 ALAN GOODMAN: And that in and of itself is
13 sometimes logistically difficult.

14 DAN MONROE: Thank you, Alan. Any other
15 committee members who wish to make comment? If not,
16 then let's make a determination. Alan, your vote
17 would be to go forward, I presume?

18 ALAN GOODMAN: That is correct.

19 DAN MONROE: Donna?

20 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Yes, to go forward.

21 DAN MONROE: Eric?

22 ERIC HEMENWAY: Yes, go forward.

23 DAN MONROE: I don't have a list in front of me.
24 Are we missing anybody?

25 SONYA ATALAY: Sonya, this is Sonya. Yes, I

1 vote to go forward.

2 DAN MONROE: Thank you, Sonya. I'm sorry.

3 SONYA ATALAY: That's okay.

4 DAN MONROE: So - and my vote also would be to
5 go forward. That being the case, we're moving
6 forward and we have a list of nominees.

7 **NOMINATIONS TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE FOR THE LIST OF**

8 **PERSONS**

9 **DISCUSSION**

10 DAN MONROE: Donna, we understand and appreciate
11 the fact that you weren't able to attend. We
12 actually delayed having this discussion and making a
13 decision because we felt it was important for all
14 members of the subcommittee to be involved in this
15 decision. We appreciate Colin's decision, and
16 understand it, to recuse himself.

17 We have, as I understand it, four candidates
18 that we have discussed previously and whose resumes
19 we've seen that we could submit and forward to the
20 Secretary. Is that correct? If so, could we have a
21 list, David, quickly of the people that have - whose
22 names have been submitted to date?

23 DAVID TARLER: Yes, four people have been
24 submitted to date for the at-large member position,
25 and they are Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, Clayton

1 Dumont, Colin Kippen, and Rosita Worl.

2 DAN MONROE: Questions about any of the
3 candidates who have been nominated that any
4 committee member would like to put forward?

5 We have two committee members with whom we're,
6 most of us, quite familiar or somewhat familiar,
7 Colin and Rosita. For my part, I'd appreciate it if
8 we could have just a brief explanation, though we've
9 seen their resumes and sort of background on the
10 other two candidates. Could those who suggested
11 them do so?

12 SONYA ATALAY: Sure, this is Sonya Atalay. I
13 suggested both of the names that were put forward,
14 so I can give I guess a brief bit of information
15 about them if you'd like.

16 DAN MONROE: Great.

17 SONYA ATALAY: Okay. Let's see. I'll start
18 with Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, and he works at the
19 Denver Museum, and has been involved with
20 repatriation cases before. He's also doing research
21 involving repatriation and NAGPRA, trying to
22 understand which kinds of collaborations and
23 consultations have been most successful. So I
24 wanted - that was why I put his name forward.

25 Is there any more information you'd like on

1 Chip that maybe I could help with or answer
2 questions about?

3 DAN MONROE: Yeah, just very briefly, just so
4 you refresh our memories jointly, could you - I
5 assume he's at the Denver Natural History Museum?

6 SONYA ATALAY: Yes, that's right.

7 DAN MONROE: And secondly, could you give us
8 some additional background regarding his education
9 and standing? The seventh member, as you all know,
10 is someone that we've traditionally looked to who
11 can bridge, in a sense, although we don't function
12 as a legislature -

13 SONYA ATALAY: Right.

14 DAN MONROE: - but can bridge both communities.
15 Could you give us - could you address or talk to
16 that issue?

17 SONYA ATALAY: Sure. Well, Chip has worked
18 pretty extensively with Native communities.
19 Although he's not a Native person himself, he's
20 worked quite extensively with Native communities,
21 mostly in the Southwest region in his previous work.
22 In terms of his education, I don't have his CV in
23 front of me, unfortunately, but I know that when he
24 received his PhD it was from Indiana University in
25 anthropology. That's pretty much all I can say.

1 DAN MONROE: Great.

2 SONYA ATALAY: Is that enough?

3 DAN MONROE: Any other questions, committee
4 members? Then, Sonya, if not, could you move to the
5 second candidate?

6 SONYA ATALAY: Right. Clayton Dumont is at San
7 Francisco State University in sociology. He is very
8 knowledgeable about NAGPRA and is published on
9 NAGPRA, although he's not in the field of
10 anthropology or archaeology and doesn't to my
11 knowledge have experience directly in museums. He
12 is a Native person, although right now I don't know
13 specifically his tribal affiliation. I can't recall
14 what it is, but I know it's available for - I could
15 try to look that up on the internet. Sorry that I
16 don't - it may be listed on his CV, a member of
17 which nation he is, but I'm not sure about it.

18 DAN MONROE: David, do you have that
19 information, by chance?

20 DAVID TARLER: I don't have it in front of me.
21 I can also add to what Sonya Atalay just said and
22 that is that you might remember Clayton Dumont from
23 the 38th meeting of the NAGPRA Review Committee in
24 San Diego when he joined a group of faculty from San
25 Francisco State University in making a presentation

1 to the Review Committee.

2 DAN MONROE: Okay.

3 SONYA ATALAY: I do know that it is one of the
4 California tribes, but I just apologize that I don't
5 recall which tribal affiliation he has.

6 DAN MONROE: Is it, do you remember, a federally
7 recognized tribe?

8 SONYA ATALAY: I'm not sure.

9 DAN MONROE: Okay.

10 SONYA ATALAY: I'm not sure. I'm sorry.

11 DAN MONROE: That's all right. No, no problem.

12 Other questions by committee members on any of
13 the candidates? Okay.

14 ALAN GOODMAN: This is Alan. I'd like to at
15 least put a proposal forward for discussion. Is
16 that -

17 DAN MONROE: Sure. Go ahead.

18 ALAN GOODMAN: What I feel most comfortable with
19 at this moment is given Dan, you know, you are the
20 only person on the committee with a lot of history
21 and seniority, that I would feel very comfortable
22 nominating either Rosita Worl and Colin Kippen as
23 two senior members who I think both have been - done
24 outstanding service on the committee. And I would
25 like to be able to see some return of some senior

1 leadership.

2 I think the other two individuals seem to be
3 excellent potential committee members down the road
4 but they're both quite a bit younger, and so at this
5 point I feel most comfortable with Colin Kippen or
6 Rosita Worl as the two people I would like to see -
7 names I'd like to see go forward.

8 DAN MONROE: Alan, would you care to make that a
9 motion?

10 **MOTION**

11 ALAN GOODMAN: I would make that a motion, yes.

12 DAVID TARLER: Mr. Chair?

13 DAN MONROE: Yes.

14 DAVID TARLER: I would like to clarify that the
15 subcommittee can propose an entire slate and not
16 necessarily just individual members.

17 ALAN GOODMAN: Let me clarify then, thank you,
18 David, that that would be my slate. It would
19 consist of two names.

20 DAN MONROE: Just to be clear, that's what I
21 understand the motion to be. Is there a second, and
22 then we'll open up for discussion.

23 DONNA AUGUSTINE: I have a question.

24 DAN MONROE: Sure.

25 DONNA AUGUSTINE: It's - we're not just

1 nominating one, it's two? Again, I'm sorry I missed
2 something here. I had a beep on my phone.

3 DAN MONROE: We have a motion on the table to
4 limit the list of four, which is currently in front
5 of us, Donna, to two, Colin Kippen or Rosita Worl.
6 And what that would imply is that -

7 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Oh, I see, yes. I understand.

8 DAN MONROE: - instead of submitting four names
9 potentially, we would submit two to the Secretary
10 and - for the reasons that Alan just gave.

11 DONNA AUGUSTINE: And then do we choose one from
12 there?

13 DAN MONROE: No.

14 CARLA MATTIX: No. Donna, this is Carla. The
15 Statute requires that the six - the subcommittee to
16 present a list of persons. So you would actually
17 present at least two names.

18 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Oh, I see. Okay. Okay.

19 DAN MONROE: We don't recommend to the Secretary
20 actually. We submit a list.

21 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Okay.

22 DAN MONROE: The Secretary has no choice but to
23 act, in fact, as a result of statutory requirements.
24 So we have a choice in front of us.

25 A motion has been made to limit that list to

1 two persons, Colin and Rosita, as opposed to a
2 possible list of four. Is there a second?

3 It appears that there is not a second. Does
4 anybody wish to make a motion to advance all four of
5 these names or three of the four or some other
6 motion?

7 DAVID TARLER: Mr. Chairman, this is David
8 Tarler. I know that the question was asked before
9 with respect to Clayton Dumont's resume?

10 DAN MONROE: Yes.

11 DAVID TARLER: And if there are any other
12 questions that I can answer I do have a copy of his
13 resume in front of me.

14 DAN MONROE: The question - one of the questions
15 was whether or not he was a member of a federally
16 recognized tribe?

17 DAVID TARLER: That, Mr. Chairman, is not in his
18 resume.

19 DAN MONROE: I see. Okay. So we're - we have
20 considered a motion to limit the list to two. How
21 would the committee like to proceed? We've rejected
22 that motion for lack of a second.

23 The Chair can't make a motion, so -

24 ALAN GOODMAN: Would somebody like to make an
25 alternative motion?

1 DONNA AUGUSTINE: I thought maybe - this is
2 Donna. And I thought maybe each person would be
3 choosing one. That's what I originally thought.
4 That's how come I'm just really thinking this over.

5 **MOTION**

6 SONYA ATALAY: This is Sonya. I'll make a
7 motion to submit the list of four names to the
8 Secretary.

9 DAN MONROE: Very good. Is there a second?

10 ERIC HEMENWAY: I second that motion.

11 DAN MONROE: Question? And that was you, Alan,
12 seconding?

13 ERIC HEMENWAY: No, that was me, Eric.

14 ALAN GOODMAN: No, that was Eric.

15 DAN MONROE: Eric, thank you.

16 Motion has been moved and seconded to submit
17 all four names to the Secretary. Open for
18 discussion.

19 ALAN GOODMAN: I would like to hear a little bit
20 of comment on nominating somebody or putting
21 somebody on the slate who is not a member of a
22 federally recognized tribe or in one case, not
23 identified as a Native American or a Native
24 Hawaiian. Is that -

25 DAVID TARLER: Mr. Chairman, this is David

1 Tarler. May I?

2 DAN MONROE: Yes, please.

3 DAVID TARLER: Probably the person with the
4 greatest institutional knowledge here is the person
5 who is transcribing this meeting, Lesa Koscielski,
6 and my understanding from a discussion with her is
7 that the first at-large member was a non-Native
8 American, Jonathan Haas from the Field Museum.

9 DAN MONROE: And subsequent seventh members have
10 been Native American?

11 DAVID TARLER: I believe that the second at-
12 large member was Vera Metcalf who is Native
13 American.

14 DAN MONROE: Right.

15 DAVID TARLER: And I know that Lesa is busy
16 transcribing, but if she would like to just confirm
17 what I'm saying, that would be appreciated.

18 LESA KOSCIELSKI: That's correct, David. The
19 first was Jonathan Haas, the second, Vera Metcalf,
20 and the third, Colin Kippen.

21 DAVID TARLER: Thank you.

22 LESA KOSCIELSKI: You're welcome.

23 DAN MONROE: Any other comments?

24 This is Dan again, I think that subsequent to
25 Jonathan Haas's term, previous committee's have made

1 a conscious choice to seek a Native American
2 representative who we felt - the committee felt and
3 I've only served on - I've not served on all of the
4 Review Committees, but I've served an extended time.
5 And I think the intent of that was to fulfill the
6 spirit of NAGPRA and to actively seek a Native
7 American representative who, while representing
8 Native American or Native Hawaiian views, also has a
9 background and grounding in one or another
10 disciplines that would give them a very broad
11 perspective. And the question I guess I'd put on
12 the table for the committee is whether or not we
13 wish to proceed in that way or whether or not we're
14 comfortable proceeding with this motion as it
15 stands, which would be to submit names of four
16 people from which the Secretary may make a choice.
17 Any comment?

18 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Dan, I'd like to make a
19 comment. Because I missed the last meeting I
20 thought maybe that Clayton Dumont had been at the
21 meeting and also Chip Colwell, and I just wasn't
22 sure. I thought maybe they were well-known or that
23 they were at the last meeting.

24 I know Rosita has been serving for a long time.
25 I know because I've been involved also as a

1 designate for my tribe and Rosita has been on there
2 a long time. And Colin was - I'm not sure if he's
3 been - not as long as Rosita, but I know that he
4 chaired part of the last meeting, the second-to-last
5 meeting, and probably this last meeting as well, and
6 I felt that he did an incredible job, you know.
7 He's been a judge before, so he really can listen to
8 both sides and I just wish that I would have met
9 Clayton. Maybe I did, but I just can't place, you
10 know, Clayton Dumont and also Chip Colwell. But I
11 know Rosita has been on there, like I said, quite a
12 while and Colin has been - has done an excellent
13 job. So I just thought I would add those comments.

14 DAN MONROE: Very good. Thank you.

15 ALAN GOODMAN: Thank you, Donna.

16 Dan, I have a meeting that is waiting for me.
17 And my main - I mean, I will vote in consensus with
18 other individuals on the committee who - you know,
19 if there is consensus that they want to go with the
20 full slate.

21 DAN MONROE: Alan, let's see if we - are there
22 any other comments under discussion of the motion
23 that's on the table to submit all four candidates to
24 the Secretary?

25 SONYA ATALAY: This is Sonya. Can I quickly

1 just get a clarification again? Is it - I know it
2 was stated, but I'd like to just have another
3 clarification on it, which is have the previous at-
4 large members, they haven't all been Native
5 American, right? We just said that.

6 DAN MONROE: No, they have not. The first one,
7 Jonathan Haas, was an anthropologist at the Field
8 Museum of Natural History in Chicago.

9 SONYA ATALAY: So -

10 DAN MONROE: Subsequent members, appointees have
11 been Native American -

12 SONYA ATALAY: I see.

13 DAN MONROE: - Native Hawaiian.

14 LESA KOSCIELSKI: Mr. Chair, this is Lesa
15 Koscielski.

16 DAN MONROE: Yes.

17 LESA KOSCIELSKI: In response to your questions,
18 I went back to the transcript from San Diego, and
19 Mr. Dumont introduced himself as a member of the
20 Klamath Tribe from Southern Oregon and a professor
21 of sociology at San Francisco State University.

22 DAN MONROE: The Klamath Tribe is federally
23 recognized, aren't they? I believe so.

24 STEPHEN SIMPSON: Yes. Mr. Chairman, this is
25 Stephen Simpson. They are.

1 DAN MONROE: Thank you, Lesa.

2 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Thank you.

3 LESA KOSCIELSKI: You're welcome.

4 DAN MONROE: Any other comments under the
5 discussion period?

6 SONYA ATALAY: This is Sonya. I'm not sure of
7 the procedures, but if it's possible - is it
8 possible to make another motion, although there is a
9 motion that I previously made on the table?

10 DAN MONROE: You can amend your motion and then
11 we can see if there's a second.

12 SONYA ATALAY: I would like to amend my motion,
13 and the amendment I would like to make is to put
14 forward three names to the Secretary, which would
15 include the name of Clay Dumont, removing Chip
16 Colwell-Chanthaphonh's name.

17 ALAN GOODMAN: I second. This is Alan.

18 DAN MONROE: It's been moved and seconded. Is
19 there any discussion? If not, is there a call for
20 the question?

21 SONYA ATALAY: Called. This is Sonya.

22 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBER: Called.

23 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Called.

24 DAN MONROE: All those in favor say aye.

25 SONYA ATALAY: Aye.

1 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Aye.

2 ALAN GOODMAN: Aye.

3 ERIC HEMENWAY: Aye.

4 DAN MONROE: Aye. Motion carries unanimously.

5 With that, thank you all and I'll turn the meeting
6 over to you, Colin, to quickly end.

7 **CLOSING COMMENTS**

8 COLIN KIPPEN: All right. This is Colin Kippen
9 back on the phone. I want to thank you, Dan. It
10 was a great job. Thank you, members of the
11 committee. I'm satisfied that 25 U.S.C. 3006
12 Section (b) (1) (A), (B), and (C) have been met. It
13 appears that two of the Native leaders have voted
14 unanimously with the committee, as well as the three
15 scientific and national museum organization members.
16 So five have voted to submit and it appears that you
17 are submitting three names to the Secretary. This
18 will end our call, but before I end the call I want
19 to say that I am thankful for the legal response
20 that I got from both Stephen Simpson and from Carla
21 Mattix. I also want to say that I hope for the good
22 health of our members and their families,
23 particularly you, Donna.

24 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Thank you.

25 COLIN KIPPEN: And finally, I want to say that

1 it is my belief that we should raise questions and
2 that reasonable people may disagree. And while I
3 did disagree with counsel as to their opinion, I
4 honor the work of the committee and the vote that
5 you have taken and I think it's an appropriate way
6 to proceed. So thank you very much. Are there any
7 further questions or comments?

8 DAN MONROE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thanks,
9 committee members and the NAGPRA staff.

10 COLIN KIPPEN: All right. So we have a list of
11 names, of three names that are going to be
12 submitted, right?

13 DAVID TARLER: Yes, Mr. Chairman. This is David
14 Tarler. I will submit the names of Clayton Dumont,
15 Colin Kippen, and Rosita Worl to the Secretary of
16 the Interior to choose the at-large member.

17 COLIN KIPPEN: All right. Thank you very much
18 for your time and your energy and for the way we've
19 been able to proceed today. Good health to all of
20 you until we meet again.

21 DAN MONROE: Thank you all.

22 SONYA ATALAY: Thank you, Colin. Thank you.

23 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Thank you, everybody. This is
24 Donna. Thank you. I'll be at the next meeting.

25 SONYA ATALAY: See you there. I'll look forward

1 to meeting you, Donna. This is Sonya.

2 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Yes. Okay, Sonya.

3 COLIN KIPPEN: Aloha.

4 DAN MONROE: Aloha.

5 DONNA AUGUSTINE: Bye, everybody.

6 DAVID TARLER: Thank you. We are adjourned.

7 **MEETING ADJOURNED**

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25